

The Concept of Culture and Cultural Transformation: Views of Malik Bennabi

Abdulaziz Berghout*

Abstract: This article aims at contributing to an integrated understanding of Malik Bennabi's view of culture and cultural transformation. An attempt is made to analyze Bennabi's concepts and ideas that constitute the core of his study of culture and its dynamic civilizing function. The paper introduces Bennabi's understanding of culture as a project with a pivotal educational value. His cultural envisioning shows that ethics, aesthetics, practical reasoning and technical skills form the nucleus of any civilizational change. The paper highlights Bennabi's view that culture is an important social and educational agent of change that can restore the sense of efficacy and creativity to the Islamic society.

Among the Muslim scholars Malik Bennabi is one of the few who have written extensively on the relationship between civilization and cultural transformation. Bennabi believes that civilization is the result of a cultural transformation that leads to the creation of the necessary synthesis for the civilization construction. By his account, the function of cultural transformation is to systematize and orient the human civilizing energy in the form of a civilizing project that can impart the initial historical thrust to a society. It is important to understand the similarities between civilization and culture as well as to describe the role of cultural transformation in any envisioning of civilization construction, because cultural transformation is the main agent of change that could create the living platform for any human civilizational advancement and progress.

* Abdul Aziz Berghout is Assistant Professor, Department of Usul al-Din and Comparative Religion, International Islamic University Malaysia. E-mail: vicegerant@hotmail.com

Cultural Transformation and the Issue of Man

Any major cultural transformation that can impart to a society the nascent push into world civilization, requires a change within the human personality, in its broad sense, that includes the human spirit, mind, behavior, social relations and style of life. In this respect, Bennabi asserts that one should “renovate the man, conforming to the true Islamic tradition and the methods of the new sciences.”¹ Hence, the renovation of man should be undertaken based on an integrative plan that can deal with the entire surroundings and factors that influence the real civilizing capacities of people. According to Bennabi, cultural transformation should extend its effects beyond mere human decorations or prestigious alterations. It should touch the essence of the human composition and substantiate its content in the form of a new synthesis of the human personality and life as well.

In line with this, it should be noted that Bennabi’s interest in the human factors and their role in cultural transformation is a logical result of his analysis of the crisis of the Islamic civilization and society. In his view, when a civilization declines, people lose all creativity and efficacy. Thus, only a new cultural project can transform human personality to play a new role in history and society.

Fawzia Bariun has noted that “Bennabi extrapolating from his general observation about post-civilizational man, felt that the Muslim of his time were simply incapable of producing another civilization. They had already lost the intellectual, moral and psychological elements that would have entitled them to respond actively to history.”² Accordingly, any solution that will not transform man himself will not create the necessary formula for a new civilization. Hence, we find Bennabi arguing that “we should change anew the personal equation of the individual.”³ In other words, reconstructing the Muslim personality should be the first task of the civilizing process in the Muslim world. Indeed, the present Muslims face the great dilemma of backwardness because they “no longer know how to apply their genius to their soil and time.”⁴ Bennabi insists that this situation would continue, “unless a total and profound change occurred in the Muslim spirit.”⁵ Therefore, he suggests that any transformation of man should focus on three important elements: his thought, his labor and his wealth.

Transformation of Man and Human Orientation

Bennabi suggests that the appropriate way to utilize human thought, labor and wealth in the civilizing process is through orientation (*tawjih*). He stresses that a theory and method for orienting these elements in a social project is required. According to him, orientation⁶ initially means the ability “to define and clarify things”⁷ as well as to “avoid the wastage of the human vital energy and time.”⁸ Additionally, orientation denotes the ability to achieve “harmony in the movement of a civilization, and unity in the objectives,”⁹ and it also denotes avoidance of conflict “between efforts which stem from the same sources and aim at similar objectives”¹⁰

Taking into consideration the above-mentioned definitions, one may underscore the importance of planning as an essential component of orientation. Bennabi stresses the idea of planning as a driving-force in the process of transforming man. By his account, our problem is not in the realm of means or objects, “rather it is in planning and organizing our capacities.”¹¹ Therefore, planning as the *piece de resistance* of orientation can influence the psycho-social and cultural situation of both man and society. Additionally, orientation assists in “the pre-definition of objectives and the determination of the practical methods and programs to achieve them.”¹² In line with this it seems that Bennabi prefers to emphasize the precedence of orientation of the intellectual and psychological dimensions of man. For him “such a change which would focus mainly on the realm of ideas, is the only way to restore the individual’s ability to create civilization.”¹³

Attributing such an importance to the intellectual and psychological aspects of man, Bennabi asserts that any attempt to reformulate the Muslim mind and personality demands a cultural project. Thus, any thinking on the problem of man is a thinking on the problem of civilization.

General Expose on the Concept of Culture

In order to fathom the position and role of cultural transformation in the new Islamic civilizing process, we should analyze the concept of culture and its relation with that of civilization. There are many views regarding the concept of culture.¹⁴ The most comprehensive classical definition of culture, which was followed by most of the sociological definitions, was provided by Edward B. Taylor as: “that complex whole which includes knowledge, belief, art, moral, law, custom, and other capabilities and habits acquired by man as a member of

society.”¹⁵ This definition concentrates more on the ingredients of culture as such, and does not show the function of culture and its dynamic movement in the social life of the individual and society.¹⁶ Within this context, culture is something inherited or given to the individual as a member of the society. It is clear that the term “acquired” in the above quotation hides the real meaning of culture as a process of transforming and modifying the traits and life of people.

In another definition provided by William P. Scott, culture is “the way of life of a social group; the group’s total man-made environment, including all the material and non-material products of group life that are transmitted from one generation to the next.”¹⁷ However, this definition does not tell us about the position and role of the individual in the cultural context nor does it show the methods and channels of the transmitting process of the values of culture from one generation to another. It just provides a superficial description of the act of transmission of the cultural values. An additional perspective is provided in the following passage:

After surveying current definitions of culture, Alfred L. Kroeber and Clyde Kluckhohn concluded that the consensus of most of social scientists is that ‘culture consists of patterns, explicit and implicit, of and for behavior acquired and transmitted by symbols, constituting the distinctive achievements of human groups, including their embodiments in artifacts; the essential core of culture consists of traditional (i.e., historically derived and selected) ideas and especially their attached values of culture.’¹⁸

The above paragraph underlines two important elements in the concept of culture: first, the patterns that govern the movement of culture are such that they match certain norms, a fact which implies the possibility of viewing it as a system and a process.¹⁹ Secondly, the definition underscores the significance of behavior in culture. In other words, culture has to do with human activity and behavior, which means that it has a function and role in the life of a group and society as well. In many other definitions, there is a greater emphasis on the components and channels of culture, rather than its functions and operational patterns. For example, in some sociological definitions culture could be defined as “the languages, norms, values, beliefs, knowledge and symbols that make up a way of life, also it is the understanding of how to act that people share with one another in any stable and self reproducing group.”²⁰ Furthermore, according to some anthropologists, culture is “the way of life of people or as what an

individual needed to know to survive in a society or as what could be learned by and individual and passed down in a society."²¹ Educationally speaking, culture can be defined as "the embodiment in the mind and life of people, of all it has achieved in thought, character and manners enriched by the association of a common land."²² Another author defined culture as "the sum total of values and concepts that govern individual and society's behavior."²³ Furthermore, another writer has emphasized the theoretical and historical dimensions of culture. He stated that culture is "a development in the philosophical thoughts...the important historical events and also development in conduct and behavior."²⁴ Taking into consideration the previous definitions, one can conclude that culture is a living human context that reflects a way of life and carries out the function of educating the members of society as well as transforming the human behavior and attitude in light of certain norms and patterns. Hence, it is culture and cultural empowerment that influences the movement of civilization and its achievements in the course of the human development.

It would be useful to look at some other contemporary attempts to link the concepts of culture and civilization.²⁵ Wittfogel defines civilization as "the totality of cultural conditions, ideas and beliefs of a given country."²⁶ Toynbee has conceived civilization as a "kind of culture found in cities."²⁷

Bennabi's Cultural Envisioning

Bennabi constructed his own view of culture with reference to his general framework and tools of analysis.²⁸ He classified the Western views concerning the concept of culture into two different philosophical stances: that of the liberal Western societies²⁹ and that of the socialist Western societies.³⁰ According to the former, culture is related more to the problems of man. Accordingly, man is the center of any conceptual analysis of culture; it all revolves around the philosophy of man as a central being whose activities constitute the core of culture. Whereas in the latter stance, culture pertains more to the issues and problems of the society, and its central theme is society.³¹ It has a functional relationship with the life and movement of a society.³²

According to Bennabi these two stances did not provide any content of culture that can be taught and transmitted among the members of society. He argues that viewing culture as a philosophy of man on one

side and as a philosophy of society on the other, may lead to conflict and social instability.³³ On one side we have the view which focuses on man and on the opposite side we have the view that takes the society as its centre. Therefore, as Bennabi puts it, in order to avoid disharmony in the development of society, we should look at the educational and ethical dimensions of culture.³⁴ In other words, one should conceive of culture as a dynamic human milieu that provides educational and ethical training for the betterment and refinement of the individual and society. Accordingly, Bennabi defines culture as:

The total sum of ethical characteristics and social values attained by the individual since his birth, as a primary resource within the environment in which he was born., culture is the living environment and milieu in which man acquires and formulates his habits and personality.³⁵

This living reality contains “external elements, such as measures, tunes, motions and internal elements, such as; tastes, customs and traditions.”³⁶ Indeed, culture is the product of the living environment, including the psychological, social, physical and religious environment. The latter, is considered as a womb for the cultural values.³⁷ Thus, one can, in the first general attempt, consider culture as an environment consisting of colours, sounds, forms, styles, motions, amiable things, pictures, and ideas spreading every where. It is the ambiance in which man is being formulated and fashioned to undertake a civilizing mission.³⁸

Eventually, the concentration on the socio-environmental approach may lead to the view that cultural values are of general influence on the different categories of society. In fact, every member of the society is involved in a social advantage with the system of the cultural values. Bennabi argues that people do not only learn culture but also breath it as values and norms from their broad environment.³⁹ “Culture is not a phenomenon stemming from school. Rather, it is a phenomenon which is acquired from the living human environment.”⁴⁰ Bennabi further argues that this living environment is quite powerful and effective in generating a civilizing movement that can change the human personality and influence human life. Culture is not only related to the issues of the individual but to a wide range of issues pertinent to the society. Hence, as Bennabi asserts, culture combines both the considerations of the individual and the considerations of the society. This integrative approach makes his concept of culture more dynamic and effective in serving the needs of the individual as well as that of

the society. In fact, Bennabi's integrative envisioning of culture and cultural transformation reflects the comprehensiveness of culture and its global impact on the entire life of people. By his account, culture concerns the whole society, the children who have not yet reached the school age. It contains the entire society and plays a pivotal role in solving the problems of its members.⁴¹ Indeed, culture, "interferes in the affairs of the individuals and in the construction of the society as well as it deals with the problems of both the leaders and the masses."⁴² If one looks deeper into the previous envisioning of culture, one can see Bennabi's strong emphasis on the notion of social education. His focus on culture as a living social environment, which involves all categories of the society, implies the notion of social education.

According to him, if culture is of a communal nature and has a civilizational function, then it has to manifest itself in the form of a social education that creates the atmosphere for every member to play his role in the development of his society.⁴³ This envisioning of culture aspires towards providing social education that teaches every individual the way of living with other individuals in order to be a civilized people. In fact, Bennabi argues that social education is nothing but culture as such.⁴⁴ Providing more explanation to the notion of social education Bennabi argues that:

Accordingly, social education (culture) is by no means a set of rules and theoretical concepts which have no authority on real life, that is on the realm of persons ideas and objects. It is not also the product of the self-styled intellectuals and encyclopedic scholars who may know all the vocabulary of dictionaries, without being aware of what it would mean in the realm of reality and facts.⁴⁵

Social education or culture according to this view should be able to modify the human reality and to construct the civilizing relations among people. In line with this analysis, education can be defined as the "general process by which a social group, whether an entire society or just a family, transmits attitudes, beliefs, behavior and skills to its members"⁴⁶ Additionally, education should aspire for the "integration of professional skills and character development, the development of a well-rounded personality, the need to master science and technology education, the need to master more than one language."⁴⁷

Indeed, this is the comprehensive meaning and role which Bennabi attributes to the concept of social education. By his account, any

education that excludes from its projects and methods the issue of man as the central object of change and cultural transformation will not generate a civilizing process. In a broad sense, Bennabi provides a wide meaning to the concept of social education by relating it to the three realms of society: that of persons, objects and ideas. He states that:

Likewise every verity which does not affect the social trinity of persons, ideas and objects is a dead verity. Similarly, every word, which does not contain an embryo of a specific activity, is but a void, indeed, dead word buried in a cemetery called 'dictionary.' Even the notion of social education shares in such a universal destiny if it is not converted in the realm of reality into efficient methods for changing man and teaching him how to live with his co-brothers, how to generate with them the means and forces that would improve the conditions of human existence and how to build together with them the network of relations that would enable the society to carry out its concerted action in history.⁴⁸

In a nutshell, culture is an important social and educational channel that contributes to the civilizing process of the human personality and the social reality. It allows the people to reform their civilization through "its transforming function" which pushes every member of the society to change himself with reference to the way of life of his society. Additionally, one should view the concept of culture as a social project that aspires to construct a relationship between leaders and masses as well as to formulate a link between the realm of ideas and that of objects.

Bennabi's Educational Envisioning and the Cultural Project

Having established such a significant and distinctive view of culture, it is only pertinent to ask about Bennabi's educational project. In what way does culture contribute to the formation of the human personality and the style of life in a society?

In Bennabi's view, one should take into consideration the age and stage of the evolution of the society and its civilization. For instance, the age and phase of development of the present Muslim society is totally different from the age and phase of the development of Western society. In the Western world, people are living at a particular stage of action, which characterizes their life with certain values and features. Therefore, their definition and orientation of culture will be related more to their own context. For them, civilized culture is something that exists in reality; they breathe it in their daily activities and it

constitutes a part of their life and development. On the contrary, the concept of civilized culture in the Muslim world is very different from that of the West. For the Muslim society, it is a question of creating a social reality, which does not exist yet. It is a matter of planning to construct a civilized culture that is still at the theoretical level. Bennabi argues that one should imagine a definition of culture not only from a theoretical point of view but also one should add to it a practical and educational point of view.⁴⁹ According to him, culture should provide a social education to the different categories of the Muslim society. Therefore, we should imagine it as an educational project, which consists of four basic elements: the ethical constitution to reconstruct the social relations, the aesthetic sense to formulate the social awareness, the practical reasoning to determine all sorts of social action and the technical art suitable for every category of the society or technique in its broad sense.⁵⁰ Hence, reviving the Muslim civilization and reconstructing the Muslim society requires a cultural project that can educate people and provide the necessary social training for their efficacy and creativity.

The Ethical Order

First of all, any cultural transformation demands an ethical order. Bennabi argues that ethics and values represent the central theme of the cultural project.⁵¹ Therefore, his analysis of ethics is not of a philosophical or epistemological nature, rather he focuses on the social functions.⁵² Ethics and values should be able to introduce to the society a complete system of social values that may consolidate and unite the different categories of people under a general order and system of life.⁵³

According to Bennabi, the role of an ethical system is to "incorporate and activate the material elements once they are integrated in a given time and space"⁵⁴ Ethics is meant to guide the relations and activities within the realm of persons, "without which the two realms of ideas and objects would not work systematically."⁵⁵ One should also note the driving force of values, particularly when they are derived from a sacred source. According to Bennabi, ethics represent principles and rules of divine nature.⁵⁶ In this regard, he argues that these morals are given by Allah (SWT) at the moment when a civilization commenced its initial stage of development. This is why the Prophet (SAS) has mentioned the importance of morals and virtues: "I have been sent as prophet of God to take moral virtues to the height of their perfection."⁵⁷

The holy Qur'ān mentions the social importance of morals in the following verse:

.....[For] if thou hadst expended all that is on earth, thou couldst not have brought their hearts together (by thyself): but Allah did bring them together. Verily, He is Almighty, Wise. (8:63).

It is obvious that ethics is related to the movement of a society and its civilization. It has a transforming function in the course of social evolution, as well as an interfering one in the concerted action of the society.⁵⁸ Bennabi argues that a society can never carry out a concerted action without the existence of a network of relations⁵⁹ that lays down the basis for the integration of its various psycho-temporal elements. Every social relationship is in its essence a cultural value embodied in the ethical rules as well as in the order peculiar to that society.⁶⁰

The Aesthetic Sense

Bennabi argues that if the ethical order is a crucial element in the educational project of culture, we should be aware that it is not the only element. In fact, there is another important element which holds an important position in the cultural project, that is the aesthetic sense. He argues that the aesthetic elements in our environment, which consist of colors, sounds, smells, movements, and pictures reveal to man his ideas and mould them in a special shape of aesthetic sense.⁶¹ He emphasized that "ideas are meaningful images, built by aesthetic interplay of colours, voices, smells and forms."⁶² Accordingly, the aesthetic sense, in which the ideas of the individual are moulded, inspires the human soul to practice the values of benediction and charity in all his activities, attitudes and habits.⁶³ It is perhaps necessary to point out the way in which Bennabi used the concept of aesthetics in his method.

In fact, the aesthetic sense is interfused within the whole life and activities of the human being: all his ideas of his reactions and responses to the internal and external world which surrounds him. The aesthetic sense affects our behavior as well as our way of approaching things within our society or within the entire universe. For instance, al-Ghazālī provides a wide meaning of the concept of aesthetics. According to him, beauty can be found in things which are not perceived by the senses, like character, knowledge, conduct and qualities.⁶⁴

Indeed, the aesthetic sense as Bennabi conceives it involves in all our movements and actions, in acts that are very simple, or in works that are most complicated, we are touched by this sense. Bennabi suggests a revealing example to show the importance of the aesthetic sense in our life.⁶⁵ He argues that the sense of a young pauper who is in tatters, to evoke people's sympathy, reveals the quality of the cultural values in his society. In other words, his condition does not so much prove poverty as it does indicate negligence and chaos.⁶⁶ It is obvious from this example that aesthetic sense interferes in our judgments and attitudes toward our environment, our relations and our activities.

In all our actions and activities, we should have justifications and motivations that could reflect to us the significance of our deeds.⁶⁷ These justifications are related to the realm of ideas and this realm appertains to the aesthetic sense. That is to say, the aesthetic sense has an important social significance if one considers it "as a source for our ideas and through those ideas the entire activities of the individual are stemmed in the society."⁶⁸ In our consciousness we act because we feel that ideas are beneficial to us. Therefore, "it is not possible for an ugly picture to reveal a beautiful imagination or a great value in our soul. It leaves a bad impression in our soul. Accordingly, the society which contain this unattractive picture must reflect this picture in its ideas, deeds and activities."⁶⁹

Apparently, when we link the aesthetic sense to ideas as well as relate it to the social context and our judgment, we realize the crucial function of this sense in our entire life. Townsend has related the aesthetic experience to the human judgment. He states that "aesthetic judgment and aesthetic appreciation cannot be described independently, for the analysis of judgment is itself based on the analysis of what is involved in aesthetic experience."⁷⁰

If our ideas are derived from the tangible pictures existing in our social environment, then, they are reflected in the soul of people who live in it. Hence, these tangible pictures become moral pictures from which our ideas are derived. Thus, "aesthetic sense found in our social environment, which contains colors, sounds, smells, movement, forms, and reveals to man his ideas."⁷¹ Any form of aesthetics that contradicts the principles⁷² of the ethical constitution will not be accepted and tolerated within the world view. When we find in our environment such unattractive pictures, this is an indicator that we are facing a cultural crisis. The reason behind this is that the "moral

principles direct the society to its goals and create the social relations network, while the aesthetic sense gives to all our ideas and activities their content which is related to our world view.”⁷³ Therefore, we should reformulate our ethical system and aesthetic sense according to our original ideal, i.e. Islam.

Practical Reasoning

Besides the ethical constitution and the aesthetic sense, the cultural project needs practical reasoning. Hence, a practical human mind that could reason logically and function orderly is needed. That is what Bennabi called “practical reasoning” which means the capacity of developing links between an action, its channels, ends and its references.⁷⁴ It is the ability to “control ourselves, to review the results of our actions and to formulate logical relations between our activities and their means on the one hand and their results on the other hand.”⁷⁵

Actually, it is this practical human reasoning that assists man to utilize his ability, will and intelligence, effectively and properly. It provides the capacity that helps in discovering the relationship between action and its objectives, policy and its instruments, culture and its archetypes, idea and its achievements.⁷⁶ Practical reasoning creates a mind-set which acts according to the patterns and rules of the “logic of implementation and action.”⁷⁷ Bennabi, in this respect, developed another important concept to analyze the function of the practical reasoning in the cultural project, that is the concept of efficacy.⁷⁸ According to him, a practical mind is an efficacious mind that may grasp the essence of the human action and directs its will and intention “towards life and one’s own problems that involve creativity, initiation and social qualification.”⁷⁹ In fact, with this vital meaning of efficacy “the Muslim may regain his ability to change the conditions in which he lives and to create and move history.”⁸⁰ Additionally, practical reasoning is the ability to formulate an “empirical mind-set which could, through applied thinking, acquire skills and abilities needed for development.”⁸¹ Bennabi argues that if one looks at the present situation of the Muslim mind, one can see the lack of the practical reasoning in many of our activities.⁸² In his words, “The Muslim world has still not arrived at the technical action stage which alone could accord to it a place in the modern world where a sense of efficacy stands first in the scale of values.”⁸³ This efficacy or practical logic is another missing element in our culture. Therefore, any

cultural project should teach people how to be more practical and efficacious.

Technology and Skills

It is still difficult to be certain that the cultural project contains all the elements required for its structure and function. In Bennabi's view, in order to draw a comprehensive picture of the complete cultural project we should add a fourth element, that is the technology and skills that help in implementing our project in reality.⁸⁴ This element has to do with the realm of objects in its broad sense that includes all sorts of techniques that a society could acquire and utilize. Techniques in his view contain "all kinds of arts, skills, abilities and the applications of all sciences."⁸⁵ In line with this, Bennabi "emphasized the importance of technical training and vocational education for Muslims. To the individual, this training is a means for making a living, and for the society it is a way to preserve itself and develop continuously."⁸⁶

In this regard, however, one finds Bariun arguing that Bennabi "addressed his project to Muslims during the first half of this century, a period when many countries had recently obtained their independence. He had no need, therefore to expand his concept of technique to a more sophisticated one. It was rather a plan for basic technical training that he believed his audience most needed at that time."⁸⁷ On the contrary, when we examine Bennabi's view on this point we can realize that he was not only aware of the training of simple techniques, but he included all kinds of sophisticated instruments that humanity could acquire and utilize. According to him, a breakthrough had occurred in the realm of objects and particularly in the technique and technology, which implies the geographical unity of humanity and the notion of the universal civilization that spreads the new techniques everywhere on the earth. He argues that "it is most of all the technical factor that has accelerated this movement. Technique has abolished space."⁸⁸ Consequently, the Muslim society is called to deal with its problems and issues taking into consideration the latest discoveries in every field of science and every aspect of life.⁸⁹ "This implies the acquisition by Muslims of professional and technical competence in all relevant fields."⁹⁰

Indeed, these four elements of the cultural project are demanded in any transforming process of the Muslim personality and the society. It is not possible for the Muslim society to regain its civilization and to construct its dynamic culture unless it reformulates its existing reality

and life based on the teachings of Islam and the patterns of the new human sciences. Bennabi puts it clearly that it is a matter of cultural orientation and civilizational construction that could change totally the spirit of backwardness and free the individual from inertia.

Notes

1. Malik Bennabi, *Islam in History and Society*, trans. Asma Rachid (Kuala Lumpur: Berita Studies In Contemporary Thought, 1993), 14.
2. Fawzia Bariun, *Malik Bennabi: His Life and Theory of Civilization* (Kuala Lumpur: Budaya Ilmu Sdn. Bhd, 1993), 128.
3. Malik Bennabi, *Ta'mmulāt fī al-Mujtama' al-'Arab* (Dimashq: Dār al-Fikr, 1986), 56.
4. Bennabi, *Islam in History and Society*, 13.
5. Bariun, *Malik Bennabi*, 128.
6. Zaki Ahmed, *Malik Bennabi and the Problems of Civilization: A Critical and Analytical Study* (Beirut: Dār al-Ṣafwāh, 1992), 97.
7. Malik Bennabi, *Shurūṭ al-Nahḍah* (Dimashq: Dār al-Fikr, 1981), 79.
8. Bennabi, *Shurūṭ*, 78.
9. Bariun, *Malik Bennabi*, 169.
10. Bennabi, *Shurūṭ*, 78.
11. Malik Bennabi, *Bayna al-Rashād wa al-Ṭayh* (Dimashq: Dār al-Fikir, 1978), 81.
12. Malik Bennabi, *Ḥadīth fī al-Binā' al-Jadīd* (Beirut: al-Maktabat al-'Aṣriyyah, n.d.), 110.
13. Bariun, *Malik Bennabi*, 128-129.
14. Alfred L. Kroeber & Clyde Kluckhohn, "Culture: A Critical Review of Concepts and Definitions," *Papers of the Peabody Museum of American Archaeology and Ethnology*, XLVII (1952):1. They mention that there are 164 definitions of culture.
15. E. B. Tylor, *Primitive Culture*, vol. 1 (New York: Brentano's, 1924), 1.
16. *International Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences*, vol. 3, (New York: Crowell Collier & Macmillan; Inc., 1986), s.v. "Educational Organization," 528.
17. *Dictionary of Sociology* (Dehli: Goyl Saab Publishers, 1988), 95.
18. William P. Scott, "A Critical Review of Concepts and Definitions," *Papers of the Peabody Museum of American Archaeology and Ethnology*, XLVII (1952): 1.
19. Ali al-Qurayshī, *Al-Tagyūr al-Ijtimā'ī 'inda Malik Bennabi* (Cairo: Al-Zahrā' li al-'ilām al-Arabī, 1989), 166.
20. Calhoun Craig, Donald Light & Suzanne Keller, *Sociology* (New York: McGraw- Hill Inc, 1990), 7.

21. John R. Hall & Mary Jo Neitz, *Culture: Sociological Perspectives*, (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1993), 17.
22. Watson Foster, *The Encyclopedia and Dictionary of Education*, vol 1 (Delhi: Akasdeep Publishing House, 1989), s.v. "Culture in Its Relation to Education", 414.
23. Awad Yussif Nur, *Al-Mukāwinat al-Islamiyyah li al-Thaqāfah al-ʿArabiyyah* (Beirut: Dār al-Qalam), 5.
24. Shalabi Ahmad, *Al-Mujtamʿa al-Islāmī*, vol. 6, 5th ed. (Cairo: Maktabat al-Nahḍa al-Miṣriyyah, 1980), 333-334.
25. For further details see Clive Bell, *Civilization and Old Friends* (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1973), 119; also see Edward McNall Burnus, *Western Civilizations: Their History and Their Culture*, 6th Ed. (New York: W.W. Norton, 1963), 23-24.
26. Karl A. Wintffogel, *Ideas and the Power Structure in Approaching to Asian Civilization* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1966), 86.
27. Arnold J. Toynbee, *A Study of History* (London: Oxford University Press, 1972), 43.
28. Zaki, *Malik Bennabi*, 98.
29. al-Qurayshi, *al-Tagyīr*, 166.
30. ʿUkāsha Shāyif, *Al-Sīrah al-Haḍarī fi al-ʿĀlam al-Islamī: Dirasah Taḥlīliyyah fī falsafat al-Haḍārah ʿinda Mālik Bin Nabī [The Civilizational Conflict in the Muslim World: An Analytical Study in the Philosophy of Civilization]* (Dimashq: Dār al-Fikr, 1986), 53.
31. al-Qurayshi, *al-Tagyīr*, 167.
32. See Bennabi, *Mushkilāt al-Thaqāfah*, 82.
33. Sulayman al-Khatīb, *Philosophy of Civilization According to Malik Bennabi* (Beirut: al-Muaʿssasat al-Jamʿiyyah li al-Dirāsāt wa al-Nashr, 1993), 151.
34. Zaki, *Malik Bennabi*, p. 96.
35. Bennabi, *Shurūṭ*, 83.
36. Bennabi, *Bayna*, 71.
37. al-Qurayshi, *al-Tagyīr*, 172.
38. al-Khatīb, *Philosophy of Civilization*, p. 154.
39. Malik Bennabi, *Qadāyāʾ Kubrā* (Dimashq: Dār al-Fikr, 1981), 80.
40. *Ibid.*, 77.
41. Bennabi, *Shurūṭ*, 85.
42. Bennabi, *Shurūṭ*, 86. For further explanation see Zaki, *Malik Bennabi*, 99
43. al-Khatīb, *Philosophy of Civilization*, 153-154.
44. Malik Bennabi, *Milād Mujtamʿ: Shabakat al-Alaqāt al-Ijtimāʿiyyah*, Trans. Abd al-Ṣabūr Shāhin (Dimashq: Dār al-Fikr, 1985), 93. The English translation of Muhammad T. el-Mesawi of the above book was very helpful.
45. *Ibid.*, 93.

46. *Encyclopedia of Sociology*, vol. 2 (New York: Macmillan Publishing Company, 1992), s.v. "Educational Organization," 535.
47. Kamal Hassan, *Towards Actualizing Islamic Ethical and Educational Principles In Malaysian Society: Some Critical Observations* (Kuala Lumpur: al-Hikmah Sdn. Bhd., 1996), 279.
48. Bennabi, *Milād*, 93.
49. Bennabi, *Mushkilāt al-Thaqāfah*, 40.
50. See Bennabi, *Shurūṭ*, 87; & *Mushkilāt al-Thaqāfah*, 67.
51. al-Qurayshi, *al-Tagyūr*, 190.
52. Bennabi, *Shurūṭ*, 88.
53. Zaki, *Malik Bennabi*, 99.
54. Bennabi, *Ḥadīth*, 71.
55. *Ibid.*, 72.
56. Abd al-Salām al-Jafairi, *The Problems of Civilization According to Malik Bennabi* (Tripoli: Dār al-Kitāb al-‘Arabī, 1982), 186-187.
57. al-Imām Abdallah bin Malik bin Anas, *Al-Muwatta’ ‘Bāb Husn al-Khulq’* (Al-Magrib: Dār al-Abaq al-Jadid, 1993), 789.
58. Bennabi, *Milād*, 45.
59. Shayif, *The Civilizational Conflict*, 114.
60. Bennabi, *Milād*, 45.
61. al-Qurayshi, *al-Tagyūr*, 196.
62. Bennabi, *Shurūṭ*, 91.
63. Bennabi, *Mushkilāt al-Thaqāfah*, 91.
64. Abu Hamid Mohammad bin Mohammad al-Ghazālī, *Ihyā’ Ulūm al-Dīn*, vol. 4 (Beirut: Al-Maktab al-Ma’ rifah, 1971), 299.
65. Abu Rayhan reported that the Prophet (SAS) has said: "God is beautiful (*jamīl*) and He loves beauty (*jamāl*)." See *Musnad al-Imām Ahmad bin Ḥanbal*, vol. 4 (Beirut: Al-Maktab al-Islāmī, 1983), 133.
66. Bennabi, *Mushkilāt al-Thaqāfah*, 83.
67. al-Qurayshi, *al-Tagyūr*, 197.
68. Bennabi, *Shurūṭ*, 92.
69. Bennabi, *Mushkilāt al-Thaqāfah*, 81.
70. Dabney Townsend, *Aesthetics, Classic Readings* (London: Jones & Bartlett Publisher, 1996), 269.
71. Bennabi, *Mushkilāt al-Thaqāfah*, 82.
72. al-Qurayshi, *al-Tagyūr*, 198.
73. Bennabi, *Ḥadīth*, 74.
74. Bennabi, *Shurūṭ*, 95.
75. Malik Bennabi, *Fikrat Kumanwilth Islamī*, Trans. al-Tayāb al-Sharīf, Second Ed. (Dimashq: Dār al-Fikr, 1990), 59.
76. Bennabi, *Shurūṭ*, 96.
77. *Ibid.*, 96.

78. Zaki, *Malik Bennabi*, 101.
79. Bariun, *Malik Bennabi*, 175.
80. Kamal Hassan, *Reflections*, 24.
81. Bennabi, *Shurūṭ*, 95.
82. al-Qurayshi, *al-Tagyīr*, 200.
83. Bennabi, *Islam In History and Society*, 97.
84. al-Qurayshi, *al-Tagyīr*, 202-203.
85. Bennabi, *Shurūṭ*, 97.
86. Ibid.
87. Bariun, *Malik Bennabi*, 176-177.
88. Bennabi, *Islam in History and Society*, 99.
89. Zaki, *Malik Bennabi*, 202.
90. Kamal Hassan, *Reflections*, 25.