

## Indian Muslims' Support for Ottoman Pan-Islamism: The Case of Shibli Nu'mani

Arshad Islam\*

**Abstract:** Following their violent suppression of the Indian Revolution of 1857, the British founded and consolidated their secular empire in the Indian Subcontinent, which marginalized and bypassed religion as far as possible, particularly Islam, which had been the official religion of the Mughal *ancien régime*. Contemporaneous Ottoman efforts to counter European imperialism led to Sultan Abdul Hamid II's (r. 1876-1909) policy of pan-Islamism, particularly the call for Islamic unity against the Russian aggression against Turkey in 1877. It was at this critical juncture that some Indian Muslim scholars gallantly volunteered to counter this threat, and to preserve the Islamic faith and heritage worldwide, despite the severe problems faced by the Muslims in India itself. This study highlights the role of an eminent scholar in this movement, namely Allama Shibli Nu'mani (1857-1914), who in 1914 conceived the idea of founding the world-famous Islamic research institute Darul Musannefin Shibli Academy in his home town of Azamgarh, Uttar Pradesh, India. Shibli was very active and instrumental in collecting donations from the wealthy landowners (*zamindars*) among the Muslim elite in his hometown of Azamgarh for the Ottoman cause, raising 3,000 rupees, which was handed to Husain Hasib Afendi, the Ottoman Consul in Bombay in 1877. Furthermore, his eloquent poetry rallied Muslims across India to support the valour and heroism displayed in the *jihad* by Ghazi Usman Pasha against the Russians. Shibli travelled to Istanbul in 1892 and met with the Pasha, on whose efforts *Tamgha-i Majidi* (gold medal) was granted to Shibli on 13<sup>th</sup> Muharram, 1310/7<sup>th</sup> August, 1892. This article is based on Shibli's major works in Urdu, particularly his arousing eulogies (*qasaid*), Turkish archival reports, newspapers and magazines, and secondary sources in Urdu and English.

---

\*Associate Professor, Department of History and Civilizations, Kulliyah of Islamic Revealed Knowledge and Human Sciences, International Islamic University Malaysia. Email: [arshad@iium.edu.my](mailto:arshad@iium.edu.my)

**Key words:** Darul Musannefin, Husain Hasib Afendi, Pan-Islamism, Shibli Nu'mani, Sultan Abdul Hamid II

**Abstrak:** Berikutan penindasan kejam pada peristiwa Resolusi India pada 1857, pihak British telah menubuhkan dan memperkasakan kerajaan empayar sekular mereka di Benua India dengan meminggirkan serta menghalang pengaruh agama di dalam pentadbiran terutamanya agama Islam. Ini adalah kerana agama Islam ialah agama rasmi Kerajaan Lama Mughal. Semasa Zaman Uthmaniyyah terdapat usaha oleh Sultan Abdul Hamid II's (r. 1876-1909) membentuk polisi pan-Islamisma untuk menentang imperialisme Eropah. Polisi ini adalah untuk menyeru perpaduan umat Islam terhadap pencerobohan Rusia terhadap Turki pada tahun 1877. Pada masa yang sama, terdapat sarjana Muslim India secara sukarela membantu untuk mengatasi ancaman ini bagi memelihara kepercayaan dan warisan Islam di seluruh dunia walaupun terdapat masalah yang serius yang dihadapi oleh mereka di negara mereka sendiri. Kajian ini berperanan untuk menunjukkan peranan penting seorang '**ulamā**' terkenal dari India bernama Allama Shibli Nu'mani (1857-1914) yang mencetuskan idea penubuhan Institut Penyelidikan Islam yang terkenal di dunia iaitu Akademi Darul Musannefin Shibli di Azamgarh, Uttar Pradesh, India, tempat asal '**ulamā**' tersebut. '**ulamā**' Shibli sangat aktif dan berperanan untuk mengumpulkan sumbangan dari pemilik tanah kaya (zamindar) di kalangan Muslim elit di kampungnya, Azamgarh untuk membantu Kerajaan Uthmaniyyah. Beliau berjaya mengumpul 3000 Rupee, yang kemudiannya diserahkan kepada Husain Hasib Afendi, Konsul Uthmaniyyah di Bombay pada tahun 1877. Disamping itu, puisi yang telah dikarangnya berjaya menyatupadukan umat Islam di seluruh India untuk menyokong keberanian dan kepahlawanan yang ditunjukkan dalam *jihad* oleh Ghazi Usman Pasha terhadap Rusia. Shibli telah mengembara ke Istanbul pada tahun 1892 dan bertemu dengan Pasha, yang menganugerahkan pingat emas, Tamgha-i Majidi kepada Shibli pada 13 Muharram, 1310/7 Ogos, 1892 diatas usaha-usaha beliau. Artikel ini juga membincangkan karya-karya utama Shibli terutamanya eulogi-nya yang membangkitkan semangat (qasaid), laporan arkib Turki, surat khabar, majalah, serta sumber sekunder dalam bahasa Urdu dan bahasa Inggeris

**Kata kunci:** Darul Musannefin, Husain Hasib Afendi, Pan-Islamisme, Shibli Nu'mani, Sultan Abdul Hamid II

## Introduction

Muslims believe that Almighty Allah (SWT) has promised to protect His 'true religion' (*Deen-e-Hanif*), both by the sword and pen of eminent believers as well as the belief of the Muslims in general. In the

cosmopolitan, eclectic, and sometimes brutal lands of South Asia, the greatest threat to Islam often came from Muslims themselves seeking worldly comforts as opposed to the Hereafter, but scholars of great stature arose to ensure the continuation of one of the greatest Islamic civilizations in history, such as Shaikh Ahmad Sirhindi (1564-1624) and Shah Wali Allah Dehlavi (1703-62), who spearheaded reforms against short-sighted rulers of their times and defended the Islamic faith and teachings by launching revivalist movements in the country (Nadvi, 2015).

Politically, Muslim rule in India was gradually eroded from the 18<sup>th</sup> century by the rapacious and duplicitous activities of the East India Company and its traitorous collaborators among local elites. This ultimately led to the direct establishment of British rule by the 1850s, and during the late-19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> centuries. The Muslims of India were faced by a vigorous triangular attack of Christian missionaries, who enjoyed strong political patronage in India; the Arya Samaj, a dogmatic and militant Hindu movement deeply prejudiced against Islam and Muslims; and Western-educated Muslims (“black-haired Englishmen”) seduced by the eye-catching materialistic achievements of Europe, particularly Britain. India and China, which historically commanded a large part of the global population and economy, were traditional, aristocratic, and sustainable civilizations with views of governance steeped in spirituality and notions of universal good; but unfortunately, they could offer little resistance to European imperialism (i.e. industrialism and capitalism) during the 19<sup>th</sup> century. Regardless of the manifest barbarity of British colonialism (e.g. the Opium Wars, 1839-1842 and 1856–1860, and the repression of the ‘Mutiny’ in 1857), local elites in both China and India were dazzled by the industrial production and evident military superiority of the West, and strived to protect their honour, dignity, and faith under the antagonistic onslaught of Christian missionaries and other ideologues of imperialism (Nadvi, 2015).

In India, Muslim intellectuals were helplessly watching the vulnerability and deterioration of their community. At this juncture, Allah (SWT) raised a constellation of eminent intellectuals and scholars to defend Islamic faith, culture and Indian people from the attacks of propagandists, such as the famous two-day open debate at Agra, 10<sup>th</sup> -11<sup>th</sup> April 1854, in which C. G. Pfander (1803-65) was

systematically refuted by Maulana Rahmat Ullah Kairanawi (1818-91) and Dr. Mohammad Wazir Khan. Nevertheless, the constant drip-feed of slow ideological poison aimed against Islam and traditional Indian civilization ultimately saturated the minds of young Muslims (Nadvi, 2015). At this crucial juncture, Allama Shibli Nu'mani, who was more at home in the gilded realm of classical learning than in the proletarian world of popular debates, applied his intellectual abilities to refuting the more astute Christian missionaries. He carefully chalked out his approach by unearthing the intellectual dishonesty and historical blunders cited by the Orientalists and by exposing and divulging their deceitful acts, as well as demonstrating the glorious past of Muslims, their history, arts, culture and Islamic civilization to world of academia, with solid arguments and evidence, to counter the Western narrative that Indians should be grateful and obsequious recipients of European culture, which liberated them from the abuses of their own ancestral traditions and heritage (Nadvi, 2015; Nadim, 2014).

Shibli felt that historical knowledge warranted a sympathetic reassessment of the legacy of Islamic civilizations, in addition to the momentary expediency of counteracting Western propagandists of imperialism. By equipping Muslim scholars with an overview of the glory of Islam and its historical past and the greatness of Islamic civilization, he felt they would be less prone to the colonial inferiority complex and more self-accepting of their own ethnic and spiritual heritage. In pursuit of this endeavour, Shibli conceived the idea of the foundation of Darul Musannefin Shibli Academy, which was established by his disciples headed by Maulana Hamiduddin Farahi (1863-1930) on November 21, 1914, three days after Shibli's death, with the following noble objectives: to nurture and sustain a body of clear headed scholars; to provide a congenial environment for scholars to create, compile and translate literary works of high scholastic and historical value; and to embark on printing and publication of the literary works of the Academy. With the above blueprint the greater contribution of Darul Musannefin Shibli Academy was to guide the young Muslim scholars to correct and publicise Islamic history, highlighting the intellectual contributions of Muslims and the civilizational role of Islam. Besides the huge human and socio-economic loss experienced by the Muslim world due to European imperialism, the subsequent Western cultural invasion threatened the very existence of the *Ummah* and the fundamentals of its religion (Nadvi, 2015; Nadim, 2014; Ahmad, 1969).

### **Shibli: A Biographical Overview**

Shibli was always instrumental in defending Islam and the achievements of Muslims throughout his career, notably in his monograph series 'Heroes of Islam', which emphasized the civilizational impact of Islam and its role in enriching human heritage. Shibli was also active in the development of both traditional and modern Islamic sciences for the Muslims of India, and he was a leading light in the Muhammadan Anglo-Oriental College (MAO), the centre of the Aligarh Movement led by Sir Syed Ahmad Khan (hereinafter 'Sir Syed'), aiming to modernize the Islamic system of education without damaging the core of Islamic learning. With this aim, Shibli also worked for the establishment of Darul Ulum Nadvatul '*ulamā*' in 1894 in Lucknow, India. Shibli acknowledged the need for modern education and the moribund nature of traditional '*ulamā*' and madrasahs, where scholars merely engaged in reiterating classical teachings and delivering lectures in their seminaries and shrines (*Khanqahs*), but unlike many of his modernist contemporaries, he was a vibrant and forceful character with profound Islamic learning to win the trust of the Muslim masses. His character represented a confluence of tradition and modernity, reflecting the Quranic verse: "maraja l-baḥrayni yaltaqiyān" ("He [Allah] let the two oceans meet", Surah al-Rahman 19) (Nadvi, 2015; Nadim, 2014; Khan, 1892; Ahmad, 1970; Qureshi, 1962).

Shibli was an outstanding person with extraordinary qualities who rerouted the direction of historical writings by championing the cause of Islam and inspiring the persecuted Muslims. He was an '*alim*', a belletrist, biographer, critic, historian, researcher, writer, philosopher, and a poet in both Persian and Urdu. Socio-political and economic changes in the Islamic world made him very attentive, as clearly reflected in some of his writings like *Al-Faruq*, *Al-Ghazali*, *Al-Mamun*, *She'ru'l Ajam*, *Sirat-i-Nu'man* and *Siratun Nabi* (Nu'mani, 1992; Nu'mani, N.d.; Azim, 1968; Ahmad, 1970; Qureshi, 1962).

Shibli was born on Thursday 11<sup>th</sup> Shawwal 1273/ 4<sup>th</sup> June 1857, which coincided with the very day on which some Indian soldiers had rebelled and broke into Azamgarh jail, set free a number of its inmates and seized the government treasury. After studying with distinguished scholars, he joined the MAO staff in 1883 and stayed there until Sir Syed's death in 1898. As an idiosyncratic and brilliant member of staff,

he was admired by Sir Syed for his intellectual abilities and academic talents, and he consequently facilitated Shibli's academic insight and studies, by offering him the use of his personal library. However, on political questions the pair were at loggerheads, as Shibli supported the Indian National Congress (INC) from its inception, despite Sir Syed's open hostility to the party (Nadvi, 2015; Nadim, 2014).

The reasons Shibli supported the INC are undoubtedly connected to his reading of Islamic history, particularly the independent structure of the Pious Caliphate (the early successors of the Prophet Muhammad (ﷺ)). Around 1892, in a debate at the Students' Union of the MAO College on the theme "Is democracy a better form of government than autocracy?", Shibli forcefully supported democracy and his firm support won majority backing. In his discourse Shibli widely quoted examples from the Pious Caliphate, particularly the process of selection, with particular reference to the quintessential Islamic ruler, Umar al-Faruq (634-44), the subject of Shibli's eponymous biographical masterpiece '*Al-Faruq*' (in Urdu), which remains unparalleled for the excellence of its historical narratives and literary elegance. During Umar's rule the independent structure and participatory nature of government institutions was highly reliable. Shibli considered democracy to be an indispensable part of authentic Islamic heritage, and as an intellectual who had exceptional interest in history, he attributed that the weakness and colonial subjugation of the Muslims, including in India, was due to the lack of democracy, which could conversely bring power and autonomy. Because of his orthodox adherence to traditional Islamic doctrines and his genuine hatred of colonialism, Shibli's voice carried great weight among the Muslim community (Nadvi, 2015; Nadim, 2014; Ahmad, 1970; Ahmad, 1969; Qureshi, 1962).

### **Pan-Islamism**

After returning from a pilgrimage to the Holy Land in 1877, Shibli was inspired by an Islamic commitment to the global Muslim community, contemporaneous with the popularisation of such concepts by figures such as Jamaluddin al-Afghani (1838-97), and specifically the slogan of Islamic unity (*Ittehad-e-Islami*) against the Russian hostility on Turkey in 1877 (Nadvi, 2015; Ozcan, 1997; Ahmad, 1964). While Shibli believed that India belonged to both Hindus and Muslims, he felt that the Muslims of India also had a humanitarian duty to their

co-religionists throughout the world. Shibli acknowledged that the Ottoman government was the only living remnant of traditional Islamic governance, and it retained traces of the glory of Islam, which endeared the state to him as a young Muslim intellectual from India, whose own Mughal empire was fading into memory. Like millions of Indians, Shibli felt he had a religious obligation to support the Ottoman Caliphate in the context of the commencement of the Russo-Turkish war of 1877-78, and in the subsequent cascade of conflicts in Eastern Europe, the Balkans and other Ottoman European territories until the First World War began in 1914. The period was marked by increasing Muslim sentiments of Islamic brotherhood, with the colonized and downtrodden Muslim masses throughout the European colonies resonating with the Pan-Islamic clarion of Abdul Hamid II. Indian 'ulamā' played a very dynamic role in supporting the Ottoman cause during the Armenian issue and the Greco-Ottoman war (1897), and the pan-Islamic orientation of the Muslims of India was a perpetual source of trouble to the imperial schemes of Britain vis-à-vis the Ottoman Empire and others (Nadvi, 2015; Farooqi, 1983; Ozcan, 1997; Wasti, 2006; Ahmad, 1964; Ahmad, 1970).

The most volatile issue of that time was the Turko-Russian war of 1877-78, which engrossed the sentiments of the entire Muslim community in India, who felt deeply affected by the developments. Indian Muslims organized many fund collection drives to financially support the Turkish war effort, with the 'ulamā' taking a leading role in such efforts. The funds thus collected were repatriated to Turkey. Shibli was instrumental in collecting donations in his hometown, Azamgarh, for the Ottoman Sultan, Abdul Hamid II. As the secretary of the *Anjuman Islam* (Islamic Society), Shibli admired the valour and heroism displayed in the *jihad* by Ghazi Usman Pasha against the Russians in the defence of Plevne. Shibli raised 3,000 rupees and handed the amount to Husain Hasib Afendi, the Ottoman Consul in Bombay (Nadvi, 2015; Ozcan, 1997; Sepetcioglu, 2015). In those days it was considered an offence in the eyes of the British government to even pronounce the name of Turkey in favourable terms, and Allama Shibli enraged the colonial administration with his famous travelogue, *Safarnama-e-Room-o-Misr-o-Sham* ("Travels in Turkey, Egypt and the Levant"), despite cautiously avoiding the issues of Turkish politics. He confined his remarks mostly to the intellectual and academic activities

he witnessed, but while the British officials considered him a *de facto* Turkish agent because of his principled support for the Ottomans, and kept watch over his movements, having him persistently pursued by the secret police (Nu'mani, 1916; Ozcan, 1997; Nadvi, 2015; Nadim, 2014; Ahmad, 1964). When Maulana Abdul Razzaq Kanpuri wrote a favourable review of Shibli's travelogue, severe annoyance was articulated by the British officials. Kanpuri was summoned by the District Magistrate who reprimanded him for praising the Sultan of Turkey as a subject of the British Crown, and the Maulana was forced to tender an apology (Nadvi, 2014; Kanpuri, n. d; Ahmad, 1970).

Apart from this, a number of other well-known Indian scholars like Maulana Qasim Nanatawi (1833-80), Ahmad Ali Muhaddith (d.1880), Maulana Muhammad Mazhar Nanatawi (1823-85) and Rashid Ahmad Gangohi (1826-1905) collected funds for the Ottoman forces, by providing financial assistance to the *mujāhidīn*, their widows, and orphans, including army personnel and common Muslims in Eastern Europe. This financial support was intended to boost Ottoman morale and demonstrate the global solidarity of the Muslims. A significant role was also played by prominent Islamic centres, such as Darul-ulum Deoband, Nadvat ul-'ulamā' Lucknow and the Farangi Mahal, all of whom zealously supported the Ottoman cause. The Colonial Government was apoplectic when a conference of prominent 'ulamā' from across India meeting at Kanpur in 1898 declared Sultan Abdul Hamid II to be a true Caliph, the position popularised by Shibli and Nadva (Nadvi, 2015; Nadim, 2014; Siddiqi, 2014; Ahmad, 1970).

### **Shibli's Love for the Ottomans**

During 1895 and 1896 the Western press was filled with screeds about the evils of the Turk in relation to the Armenian-Turkish civil war, as the European colonialists sought to piece the Ottoman provinces, by spreading anti-Turkish misinformation throughout their imperial possessions. When exaggerated reports began appearing in the Indian dailies as well, Allama Shibli could not restrain himself. On 21 February 1896, in the *Azad* newspaper of Lucknow, Allama Shibli wrote a sarcastic retort, in which he divulged the factual truth and exposed them of spreading baseless reports (Hasan, 1991; Ahmad, 1964).

Allama Shibli met the famous Indian intellectual Atiya Begum Fyzee (1877-1967) in Bombay when she returned from her sojourn



in Turkey. According to her, Turkey was a plaything of the European powers, and the new regime was a puppet at the mercy of foreign powers, who had enslaved the Ottoman state with debt. Shibli outright rejected her opinion and obstinately continued to idealise the Ottoman state, particularly the Sultan, who Shibli maintained had successfully played the cards of European politics for 32 years. On November 22<sup>nd</sup> 1910 he again sent her an Urdu couplet saying that the Turks had shown their vigour (Nadvi, 2015; Nadim, 2014; Murad, 1996).

### **Impact of Shibli's Comments on Muslim Activists**

Shibli inspired a younger generation of intellectuals, particularly in their concern about the Ottoman Caliphate and Pan-Islamism. His passionate poems and articles published in the *Muslim Gazette* stirred up many political activists, like Maulana Abul Kalam Azad (1888-1958), Maulana Zafar Ali Khan (1873-1956), Maulana Mohammad Ali Jauhar (1878-1931), and his brother Maulana Shaukat Ali (1873-1938). Shibli's radical ideas inspired the Muslim masses in general and the Muslim intellectuals in particular. Zafar Ali Khan was moved by Shibli's poems on the evils inflicted upon Islam and inspired by his articles published in the *Muslim Gazette*. He was also influenced by the writings of the editor of *Al-Hilal*, Maulana Abul Kalam Azad (Nadvi, 2015; Robinson, 1993; Qureshi, 1999; Ahmad, 1964; Daryabadi, 1943; Ahmad, 1970; Sepetcioglu, 2015).

Shibli's revolutionary poems published in *Muslim Gazette* (Urdu weekly, 1912-13 by Wahiduddin Salim and Syed Shabbir Hasan, Lucknow), *Al-Hilal* (Urdu weekly, 1912 by Maulana Abul Kalam Azad, Calcutta), *Hamdard* (Urdu daily, 1913 by Maulana Mohammad Ali Jauhar, Delhi) and *Zamindar* (Urdu daily, 1903 by Maulana Zafar Ali Khan, Lahore) created a sensation in the country that developed political interest among the Muslims. Soon his collection of poems was seized by officials in Bengal and United Provinces (Nadvi, 2015; Ahmad, 1964; Sepetcioglu, 2015). On the occasion of the Balkan wars (1912), Shibli wrote his most stirring poem *Shahr Ashub-i Islam* ('Ruined City of Islam') to show his solidarity with the Turks, which left a great impact upon the Indian Muslims. He recited this long and stirring poem before a public gathering at Lucknow for the collection of donations for Turkey. Shibli recited this poem in a passionate manner, and the whole audience started to cry along with him. In his poems, Shibli prophesied

many things that turned out to be true. Khwaja Kamaluddin (1870-1932) from Lahore repeatedly shed tears after reading these verses in London and wrote a letter to Shibli in which he quoted the verse *Chiragh-i-kushta-e mahfil se uthega dhuan kabtak* ('How long will rise the billowing smoke from the extinguished lamp?'): (Nu'mani, 2012, pp. 125-127; Ahmad, 1964)

### City of Islam in Ruins

Written in the aftermath of the Italian-Turkish and Balkan Wars

This lament represents a genre of poetry in which the poet bemoans the destruction or social and economic decline of a city or country. This genre of poetry is known as *Shar Ashub* (Nu'mani, 2012, pp. 18-19, 119-121).

How long will remain the prestige of a nation when dominion is gone,  
How long will rise the billowing smoke from the extinguished lamp.

The very mantle of the Sultanate has been torn to smithereens,  
How long will the fragments continue to fly in the sky.

Morocco has fallen, Iran gone; it is to be seen,  
How long the diehard sick Turkey survives.

Fast deluge of unmitigated calamity that is surging from the Balkans,  
How long could it be warded off by desperate sighs of the oppressed!

How long it could be stopped by the smokecreen of the sighs of the  
oppressed,  
How long will the half-dead martyred to keep the show going!

They revel in listening to the cries of the oppressed,  
How long will the infirm orphan keep on this chord!

-----

Can someone ask, 'O ye dons of culture,  
How long this tyranny, how long this oppression!

How long these storms of tyranny and oppression!  
How long the pleasure at the moaning and wailing!

We know you want to test the sharpness of your swords,  
How long will this test go on over throats.

If you have not seen the pictures painted of blood,  
How long do we show you oozing of blood from our wounds!

Indeed, you want warmth of your company,  
How long should we recount our anguish and pain!

Well, tales of woes and sorrow are enjoyed by you

How long do we recite to you hailes of our heart wounds?

Know we that you have a grouse against the sky for the drought,  
How long do we bleed to water your fields!

You need decorative material to adorn the bride of fortune,  
How long will our particles of dust will be used as adornments!

How long will you take revenge for the victory of [Salahuddin]  
Ayyubi!

How long will you show us spectacles of the Crusades!

Taking us to be but faint shadow of the glory bygone,  
How long, in this manner, will you erase our trace!

Decline of the Ottomans is the decline of the *sharia* and *millat*,  
How long, dear ones, this concern for kith and kin, wealth and status

By God, do you comprehend what these preparations portend!  
How long, if not for now, will it take you to unravel this mystery!

Should the votaries of the Ka'ba be gone,  
How long, then, will remain the sanctity of this place of adoration of  
angles!

When the bells of the cathedral will echo through the lands,  
How long, then, will songs of tawhīd and the melodious *adhaan*  
remain!

Leaves of the legacy of Islam are being scattered,  
How long will blow these tumultuous winds of idolatry!

Perchance these gusts of idolatry affect the precincts of the *Haram*  
How long will the undaunted dust of disbelief continue to spread!

When the sight of the hunter is trained on the Holy Lands,  
How long, then, will survive the birds of the Haram.

Where to go even if Shibli you want to migrate!  
 How long, now, will peace and security in Syria, Najd and Qairwan  
 endure!

### **Agha Khan's Address to the Turks**

This poem was penned by Allama Shibli Nu'mani as a satirical response to Agha Khan's call to the Ottoman Ruler during the Balkan war to vacate the European territories ruled by his forbears for centuries and retreat to Asia, so as to escape the frequent attacks from European nations. This stand of the Agha Khan led to a wave of discontent among large sections of Indian Muslims (Nu'mani, 2012, pp. 125-127; Nadvi, 2015; Sepetcioglu, 2015).

To the Turks said the honourable Agha,  
 Why are you, for no good reason, subject of affliction in Europe!

If you withdraw to Asia, then therein you will remain forever;  
 Spread out your feet at will, and sleep unperturbed!

You will soon realize the futility of modern tools,  
 The instant you withdraw to the valley of the Tatars.

Now, you will not need the railway and telegraph anymore;  
 For relay of mails, will come the birds of the Haram.

Admit you will on your own volition: no use there is for musket;  
 When will be demonstrated the art of archery?

Will depart from your heart the need for sea cable,  
 When you will see the intricate knots of the scaling rope-ladder

Why should you be indebted to railways?  
 In what way your swift footed is lacking!

When you, in the wilderness, drive the ship of the desert [camel],  
 No need will there be for steam, nor any anxiety about storms.

The melody that bells round the neck of cattle evoke cannot be  
 matched by the whistle (of the train)  
 None can say of the saddle: it's not better than a berth.

Where do we find in the glow of the bulb?  
 The allure that a candle radiates in a gathering

Decisions taken by village elders in their assembly,  
Will be more incontrovertible than laws of Europe

Agreed, Europe is Paradise personified;  
But Sheikh Sa'adi of Shiraz has recorded thus:

“My father bartered the garden of heaven in exchange for two grains  
of wheat,  
I would not be a worthy son of my father, if I didn't sell it in return for  
a grain of barley”.

**Shibli Nomani's Tribute to the Turks on their Victory at  
Adrianople during the Balkan War: 8th December 1912 (Nu'mani,  
2012, p.128).**

O Turk! O the one who epitomises the Majesty of Lord,  
O you on whom all of existence takes pride!

You, the bulwark of the community of the last of the Prophets!  
You are today the source of the strength of the King of Hejaz (the  
Prophet);

Every page of the existence gets its colour from your sword,  
Europe has been the theatre of your wars and excursions for so long

You have re-established that your decapitating sword,  
Still holds the secret of the annihilation of your adversaries;

Every page of the map of the world that is colourful,  
Owes its hues to the brandishing of your sword!

**Prelude to the Ode in Honour of the Ottoman Sultan Abdul Hamid  
Khan II (Nu'mani, 2012, pp. 78-79).**

Again, came the spring, and lush are the plains and the gardens  
Once again, the garden has become the envy of Paradise.

Once again, the flowers of the garden have taken on a fiery hue  
Once again, the breeze moves about in the garden treading with care

Someone, perhaps, has set the water on fire  
Is it the tulips that appear to be mirrored in the pond, or is it the tulips  
themselves that adorn it

The glee that the breeze in the garden has spread,  
 Makes each leaf, on every branch, bow in salutation

When the witness to the flowers ascended the embellished couch,  
 The songbirds exclaimed, "To whom belongs this land!"

Playfully moves about the waft of air from the morning breeze, all  
 through the garden;  
 Swinging and swaying by come the clouds toward the courtyard of the  
 garden.

Thunder appears in short bursts from amidst the thick clouds that have  
 loomed above;

Raindrops come down; the wafts of wind making melodious sounds

Branches twist and turn as one woken up from sleep, amidst the  
 intoxicating morning air;

In rapturous symphony does every flower leaf sway.

Those mild wafts of the morning wind,

Those distinctive bosoms of the newly-wed bride of the garden

The eyes of the narcissus beholding the unfolding of the scenes,  
 Even the flower buds reveal their petals in a smile

Why have the bubbles begun peering out of the pond?

Not visible to them under water was the charming garden

Every atom is beholden to the favours of the spring breeze,  
 Even the dust is holding on to the hem of the wind

High on pleasure, everything seems inebriated;

The garden nevertheless is a nation of tranquillity and comfort

Whenever wake up the children of the garden from slumber,

The breeze of the garden gently pats them back to sleep.

### **Dr. Mukhtar Ahmad Ansari's Medical Mission**

On the initiative and the great efforts of Maulana Muhammed Ali Jauhar, a medical mission under the stewardship of Dr. Mukhtar Ahmad Ansari (1880-1936), was sent to Turkey in November and reached Istanbul on the last day of 1912 and stayed continuously in Turkey until

late June 1913, to provide medical aid to the casualties of the Balkan Wars, assisting injured soldiers and refugees. The other members of this mission were Shuaib Qureshi, a minister in the state of Bhopal, Chaudhry Khaleeq al-Zaman, an advocate of Lucknow, Abdul Rahman Siddiqi, a member of the Bengal assembly, Abdul Aziz Ansari, and others. Most of these young volunteers were then pursuing their studies at MAO College. Such was their Islamic bond and commitment to the cause and attachment with the Turks that they put their educational pursuits on hold, to be part of the noble medical mission to help their Muslim brethren in grieving Turkey. Syed Abdur Rahman and Naeem Ansari had just completed their medical education in Britain and directly joined the mission at Constantinople because of their perceived Islamic obligation to the situation in Turkey. All expenses of the medical mission, including the cost of medicines and equipment, were fully funded by the Indian Muslims. The Indian Medical Mission was also committed to funding and providing all possible help to the humanitarian endeavour to remedy and mitigate the miseries and plight of the Balkan refugees, particularly their resettlement, which was directly supervised by the Indian team when they arrived in Turkey. They recorded refugee stories of their plights, including narratives of murder, mutilation, rape, expulsion, and the long march to safety in Ottoman realms (Nu'mani, 2016; Nadvi, 2015; Akçapar, 2014; Nadim, 2014; Ahmad, 1964; Sepetcioglu, 2015). This was the first major contribution of the Indian Muslims to their Turkish brethren and it was as significant in inspiring pride among Muslims at home in India as it was in providing the help needed. Dr. Mukhtar Ahmad Ansari got more print media attention because of the regular reports sent home by him that was published in *The Comrade*, an English weekly newspaper published in Calcutta, 1911 by Maulana Muhammad Ali. In an act of vengeance and frustration, the British authorities hurriedly closed *The Comrade* after the letters on Turkey were published (Nadvi, 2015; Nadim, 2014; Niemeijer, 1981; Sepetcioglu, 2015). There was a deeply moving and emotional scene at the Lucknow railway station, when Dr. Ansari was leaving for Delhi, en route to Constantinople. Many local dignitaries had come to see him off. Dr. Ansari was standing at the door of the railway compartment, while Allama Shibli was standing on the platform, looking up at him. Just as it was time to say goodbye, the head of this great scholar, which had refused to bow down before powerful tyrants, bent down and kissed the boots of Dr. Ansari, in veneration of

his service to the Allah and His Messenger (ﷺ) by departing to the Ottoman Caliphate to serve the victims of war; tears rolling down his eyes and washing the dust of the boots. The train moved on, taking with it the precious jewels of Islamic honour and dignity (Nadvi, 2015; Nu'mani, 1916; Ozcan, 1997; Nadim, 2014). After the end of the Balkan Wars (1912), Dr. Ansari's medical mission returned to India and landed at Bombay. By sheer chance Allama Shibli was in Bombay, and without delay, he went to receive Dr. Ansari and the delegation at the Docks. As he was disembarking, Allama Shibli stepped forward to kiss his feet, but this time Dr. Ansari excused himself, Allama Shibli said, "It is not your feet rather it represents the suffering of Islam". It was these very sentiments that found expression in the form of a lament which he read out before a gathering in Bombay that had been convened to felicitate members of the medical mission which had just returned from Turkey. It is a very heart-rending poem (Nadvi, 2015; Nadim, 2014; Ali, 1999; Sepetcioglu, 2015; Akçapar, 2014):

### **Welcoming Dr. Ansari**

This poem was recited in a gathering, in Bombay, convened in honour of the returning Indian Medical Mission to Turkey led by Dr. Ansari ((Nu'mani, 2012, pp. 122-124; Nadim, 2014; Sepetcioglu, 2015).

### **Balkan War: 1912**

We offer our fervent thanks to Allah, the Almighty  
On the safe return of the delegation of Ansari

You traversed thousands of miles to serve our brethren,  
This was true Islamic spirit, this was manifest compassion.

Leaving the country, forsaking the family, and traversing a vast  
distance bravely,  
By God's Grace, you did endure these travails admirably.

For stopping you there was much in form of tumult,  
Voices of anguish and pain and lament

The grieving eyes of relatives, and their piercing, longing looks;  
Anguish of torn hearts, and the soaring sparks of filial love.

But the love for Islam, overcame all hurdles;  
Leaving everything behind you managed to reach there in spite of  
many problems.



In truth, you're both an Anṣār (helper) and a Muhājir (migrant);  
As forsaking your countrymen you reached there to fulfil the requisites  
of friendship.

None can attain, even in their dream, such wonderful bliss;  
Night-vigil for the sick and injured which you did endure.

In truth, it befits you to claim leadership;  
Because the Turkish mujāhidīn you nursed with care tender.

No amount of accolades the community may shower on you may be  
adequate,  
For pains you endured in providing succour to soldiers of religion.

For you a string of pearls has far less value glass pebbles  
For, you have witnessed, in the eyes of the orphans, gems real.

Appreciate you will how cherishes Islam life,  
Having witnessed wanton blood-letting of the Christians.

Despite the virtual effacement of the Islamic sympathy,  
One can still discern, within your throbbing heart, some flickers of  
compassion.

Seen you have the declining fortune of the Muslims,  
The turning of tides of time you have observed.

How can the dwellers of Hindustan fathom your heart's pains,  
For, seen you have the ever-increasing tyranny.

You have heard the heart-wrenching lament of the orphans;  
Seen you have the unhappy faces of the destitute widows.

Burning alive the dwellers, after plundering their homes;  
Seen you have, the new norms of the Western powers.

The massacre of the Muslims, and the destruction of the Turks;  
Seen you have, the results of consequences of the assurances of  
Gladstone.

It's you who have sutured the wounds of the warriors;  
Seen you have, the blood-stained garments of the martyrs.

We have seen those many varied calamities,  
Seen we have, many kinds of distress.

Have seen the shades of tear shedding eyes,  
 Have seen the rose-coloured cheeks of the faithful martyred play?

-----

From you we get some trace of those who love the community;  
 Seen you have since those enamoured of Islam.

Intense love and fervour of Islam, if anyone has understood, it's you;  
 Seen you have since the Majnu of Islam's Layla.

If there is still some hope to hold on,  
 Seen you have also, since, the signs of the secrets power.

It would be no surprise, should bounce back the ship after being  
 drowned,  
 Seen we have, since, the overturning of fortunes like this.

If acceptable to Providence is an old person's supplication,  
 These, then, are hands raised in prayer, and this then is Shibli Numani!

### **A Fatwa**

During the Balkan Wars, one year the days of 'Eīd *al-*' Aḏḥā coincided with an escalation in the conflict. Allama Shibli felt it would be an excellent idea if the money that would be spent on sacrificing animals during the 'Eīd *al-*' Aḏḥā festival could instead be donated to the Turkish war fund to support those who were in the frontline offering their own lives in sacrifice to defend the Islamic Caliphate.

From the point of view of Islamic jurisprudence, Shibli found no prohibition on the donation of cash in lieu of animal sacrifices in special circumstances. He conferred with Mufti Mohammed Abdullah Tonki in this matter. He also wrote to Maulana Abdul Bari of Farangi Mahal, seeking his opinion. When they were shown the fatwa that was prepared in this regard, they supported the initiative. Satisfied with the endorsement received from these eminent scholars, he had the fatwa distributed widely through newspapers. With the fatwa permitting donating the cost of the proposed sacrificial animal in cash to support the Turkish brethren gaining momentum, thousands of rupees were collected as donations (Nadvi, 2015).

However, some 'ulamā' disputed his *ijtihad* (deduction) in this matter. Maulvi Zafar Ali Khan wrote to him expressing his disagreement with the fatwa. On 16 November 1912, Allama Shibli replied to the letter in these words:

Dear Maulvi Zafar Ali Khan Saheb, Assalamu Alaikum

The fatwa that I published has met with the approval of the 'ulamā' of Farangi Mahal and the letter of Maulvi Abdul Bari supporting the fatwa has also been published. In the book al-Hedaya [*The Guidance*, a classic compendium of Hanafi jurisprudence] we can find a clause that allows the donation of cash in lieu of an animal sacrifice. However, the clause only permits this mode. I have gone further and have issued a ruling that in these circumstances it is preferred to do so (Nadvi, 2015; Nadvi, 2000).

Brother, supporting the Turks in the situation in which they are is *Fardh al Ain* (Mandatory) on us; while animal sacrifice is, at best, not greater than a *Wajib* (lower in importance to *Fardh al Ain*). You say that the *sunnat-e-Ibrahimi* (the practice of Prophet Ibrahim, peace on him) must not be suspended. Indeed, keeping this sunnah alive is my objective too. The difference between us is that you restrict this sunnah to sacrificing an animal, while I extend it to the sacrifice that was asked to be performed of Ismail (peace be on him). Is the worth of an animal greater than the life of a Turk? (Nadvi, 2015; Nadvi, 2000).

Subsequently, on 17<sup>th</sup> November 1912, Allama Shibli published a letter in the newspapers:

Some people are of the impression that the institution of animal sacrifice will begin to be considered as inconsequential and unwanted if we were to donate to the Turkish cause the money that would have been spent on sacrificing animals. But this position is not correct. In the Shari'ah, there is a sequence specified even in acts that are *Fardh*; and care has been taken to accommodate special needs arising out of unprecedented events. During the Battle of the Trench (Khandaq), for instance, due to the demands of war, Prophet Muhammad (ﷺ) missed his Asr prayer once. From this, can we infer that it is permissible to miss a prayer? Supporting the Turks now is *Fard al Ain*. What kind of a precedent will it

set if, in the given circumstances, we were to give preference to this *fardh* over animal sacrifice?

The sacrifice of an animal (whereupon Muslims eat of its meat and distribute some to the poor) is a symbol of Islam and the Covenant of Allah with Ibrahim (peace be upon him) and the Muslims after him in perpetuity, and the Muslims can never forsake it. No worldly power can make them give it up, nor will they need fear any nation in carrying out the sacrifice (Nadvi, 2015).

### **Establishment of a Muslim University (Madinah University)**

Indian Muslims viewed the Ottoman Caliphs as the spiritual leaders of Islam and Muslims, and they gave physical, moral and monetary support to the Ottoman Sultans and peoples by sending volunteers, money, and an enormous volume of gold in the form of their personal jewellery to protect the Muslim Ummah. During 1912-13, the Balkans uprising and the Italian aggression on Tripoli caused much tumult and sensation in the Muslim world. The Muslims from different parts of the globe were resolutely supporting the Islamic notion of brotherhood and the Ottoman peoples. On the initiative of Maulana Muhammed Ali Jauhar, a medical mission under the leadership of Dr. Mukhtar Ahmad Ansari, Maulana Zafar Ali Khan, and many more came to Istanbul and stayed in Turkey to help the Muslims suffering from the European aggression. During their stay and meetings with the Ottoman officials and intellectuals the idea of the establishment of an Islamic university under the name of Madinah University was conceived. The prime aim of enrolling students from all over the Muslim world, and a dedicated team of experts of international repute would be appointed to teach and guide them. A committee ostensibly constituted by the Turkish Government and consisting of Shaikh Abdul Aziz Shawesh Tunisi (1876-1929), Maulana Zafar Ali Khan and Dr. Mukhtar Ahmad Ansari suggested the names of Maulana Shibli, Maulana Hamiduddin Farahi and Allama Iqbal (1877-1938) to draw syllabus for the proposed Madina University. In pursuance of it, Maulana Shibli published a letter in Zamindar, Lahore, on the 29<sup>th</sup> May 1913. Many suggestions came in this regard which were published in Daily Zamindar and Weekly Al Hilal. While the work had begun as a project, due to the breakout of World War 1 it had to be shelved (Nu'mani, 2016; Nadvi, 2015; Nadvi, 2000; Minault, 1999; Zilli, 2013).

The Madinah University project was taken seriously and the nominated panel of scholars were very passionate to design the curriculum. It was a source of great pride that all three great scholars were nominated from the Indian Subcontinent. According to a letter published in *The Comrade* dated 10<sup>th</sup> May 1913, Shaikh Abdul Aziz Shawesh Tunisi was to be its first Vice-Chancellor. However, the ceremony of the foundation stone of this university was laid on 1<sup>st</sup> Muharram 1332/ 29<sup>th</sup> November 1913 by the imperial command (*hatt-i hümayun*) of the Ottoman Sultan Muhammad Reshad Khan V (r.1909-18). The university was located on the opposite side of the Hejaz Railway station at al-‘Anbariya Street; the dignitaries attended the foundation ceremony Hassan Basari Pasha, the Governor of Madinah, Zewar Pasha, the Shaikh al-Haram and Qazi Baldah, the Hanafi and Shafi’i muftis and other notables from Madinah, and the delegates from Istanbul Shaikh Abdul Aziz Shawesh, Shakib Arslan (1869-1946) and Abd al-Qadir al-Maghribi (1867-1956), along with Turkish engineers, architects, and other experts in building structure (Nadvi, 201; Zilli, 2013).

The announcement of this proposed university was welcomed by the Indian Muslims with pride and joy because they viewed it entirely from an Islamic angle, and felt proud to serve the cause of Islam by contributing in the field of Islamic knowledge and learning. The Madinah University project was very important and dear to Shibli, as can be read in excerpts of his letters published in various journals and newspapers, but before his dream could be fully actualized, he passed away on Wednesday 18<sup>th</sup> November 1914 (Nadvi, 2015; Zilli, 2013).

The initial construction work was in progress and the first storey of the structure was completed in 1915-16. The enrolment of students had already started and they were temporarily housed in Jamiya Salahuddin al-Ayyubi, Jerusalem. It is surprising to note that the name of the Islamic University Madinah was proposed as Jamiya Salahuddin al-Ayyubi, and an institution of the same name already existed in Jerusalem. Due to gravity of the First World War and the changing political scenario in Turkey, the construction work of the Madinah University was shelved, particularly as the local tribes in the Hejaz spearheaded the infamous Arab Revolt from 1916. Subsequently, the existing structure remained there and a portion was used as a store house and another portion housed a printing press imported from Istanbul, while the remaining part with

an addition of another storey housed the first secondary school known as Thanawiya Tayyaba Madinah (Zilli, 2013).

## Conclusion

Shibli had a global and eternal impact on the Muslim *Ummah* with his celebrated biography *Siratun-Nabi* and *Al-Faruq*, and within India his radical ideas had a profound influence on all 'ulamā', young Muslim political activists and the Muslim masses alike, as well as being a vociferous voice of anticolonialism in India. Under his guidance many well educated Muslims like Maulana Hamid al-Din Farahi, Maulana Abul Kalam Azad, Maulana Muhammad Ali Jauhar, Maulana Shaukat Ali, Maulana Zafar Ali Khan, and Dr. Mukhtar Ahmad Ansari played a very significant role in the politics of India. Shibli was a champion of Muslim unity and always advocated this idea among his compatriots, and he had strong pan-Islamic affiliation with the Ottoman Sultanate. Having grown up in the aftermath of the British liquidation of Mughal India (and with it, the organic living core of traditional Indian civilization as well as the institutions of Islam in South Asia) it was only in the Ottoman Caliphate that he discerned the sparks of the glory of Islam, which endeared it and its people to him. Shibli, as a young Muslim campaigner of Islam from India, was galvanized to fulfil his religious obligations towards the Ottomans following the instigation of the Russo-Turkish war of 1877-78. Darul Musannifin, Shibli's premier research institution, became a nerve centre and a hub of Muslim politics. Subsequently, Shibli's successor there, Syed Sulaiman Nadvi, had considerable influence on Muslim politics in India and abroad for a sustained period of time. The medical mission under the leadership of Dr. Mukhtar Ahmad, Maulana Zafar Ali Khan and many more went to Istanbul and fulfilled their Islamic obligations by helping the needy Muslims. By his nature, Shibli was bold, democratic, anti-imperialist and pan-Islamist. He tried his best to instil these qualities among the Muslims through his writings and sensitive poems. He had a great vision of the glory of Islam and Muslims due to his vast knowledge of history, particularly of the early caliphate and the Abbasids. Situating modern European imperialism within this classical narrative, Shibli was a dissenting voice that mattered a lot, and which resonated among the *Ahrar* (liberals) and luminaries of freedom. Shibli sifted through heaps of tradition, and the history of Islam, with critical acumen and free from bias, and his version of events therefore has generated more light than

heat. In short, Shibli's legacy may be said to reside in the fact that on the one hand he succeeded in kindling political interest in the Muslim masses, and on the other he succeeded in awakening the Muslim masses from their somnolence, forcing them to see the real nature of colonial oppression and their dispossession by his blazing oratory on issues like Tripoli and the Balkan Wars.

## References

- Ahmad, Aziz. (1964). *Studies in Islamic Culture in the Indian Environment*. Oxford: Clarendon Press Oxford.
- Ahmad, Aziz. (1969). *An Intellectual History of Islam in India*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University press.
- Ahmad, Aziz. (1970). *Islamic Modernism in India and Pakistan*. London/Bombay/Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Akçapar, Burak. (2014). *People's Mission to the Ottoman Empire: M.A. Ansari and the Indian Medical Mission*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Ali, Maulana Mohammad. (1999). *My life, A Fragment: An Autobiographical Sketch* (Mushirul Hasan Ed.). New Delhi: Manohar Publishers and Distributors.
- Azim, Akhtar Waqar. (1968). *Shibli Bahaithiyat Muarrikh*. Lahore: Sang-e-Meel Publications.
- Daryabadi, Abdul Majid. (1943). *Mohammed Ali: Zaati Diary Ke Chand Araq*, Hyderabad Deccan: Idara-i- Ishaat-i-Urdu.
- David, L. (1978). *Aligarh's first generation: Muslim solidarity in British India*. Princeton: Princeton University Press/New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Farooqi, Naimur Rahman. (1983). Pan-Islamism in the Nineteenth Century, *Islamic Culture*, 57, 4 (October 1983), 283-296.
- Hasan, M. (1991). *Nationalism and communal politics in India, 1885-1930*. New Delhi: Manohar Publications.
- Kanpuri, M. A. Razzaq. (n.d). *Al-Baraamika*. Lahore: Nawal Kishor Press.
- Khan, Syed Ahmad. (1892, June 28). *Ashiyai Aur Islami Tarz-i-Hukumat*. *Aligarh Institute Gazette*, 52, 690-693.
- Minault, Gail. (1999). *The Khilafat Movement: Religious Symbolism and Political Mobilization in India*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Murad, Mehr Afroz. (1996). *Intellectual Modernism of Shibli Nu'mani*. New Delhi: Kitab Bhavan.

- Nadim, Khalid (2014). *Shibli Ki Aap Biti*, Azamgarh: Darul Mussanefin Shibli Academy.
- Nadvi, Syed Sulaiman ed. (2000). *Maqalat-i-Shibli*. Azamgarh: Darul Musannifin Shibli Academy.
- Nadvi, Syed Sulaiman. (2015). *Hayat-i-Shibli*. Azamgarh: Darul Musannefin Shibli Academy.
- Niemeijer, A.C. (1981). *The Khilafat Movement in India 1919-1924*, Netherlands: Springer.
- Nu'mani, Muhammad Shibli. (1335/1916). *Safarnama-e-Room-o-Misr-o-Sham*. Delhi: Matbah Tuhfa Jannat.
- Nu'mani, Muhammad Shibli. (n. d.). *Al-Faruq*. Delhi: Murid Book Depot.
- Nu'mani, Muhammad Shibli. (2012). *Kulliyat-i-Shibli*. Azamgarh: Darul Musannifin Shibli Academy.
- Ozcan, Azmi (1997). *Pan-Islamism: Indian Muslims, the Ottomans and Britain (1877-1924)*. Leiden; New York: Brill.
- Qureshi, Ishtiaq Husain. (1962). *The Muslim Community of the Indo-Pakistan Subcontinent (610-1947)*. The Hague: Mouton & Co.
- Qureshi, M. N. (1999). *Pan-Islam in British Indian politics: A study of the Khilafat movement, 1918-1924*. Leiden: Brill.
- Robinson, F. (1993). *Separatism among Indian Muslims-the politics of the united provinces Muslims: 1860-1923*. Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Sepetcioglu, T. E. (2015). The Image of Turks Among Indian Muslims: The Case of Balkan Wars. *Journal of Ottoman Legacy Studies (JOLS)*, 2:2, (March 2015), 50-73.
- Siddiqui, Atif Suhail. (2014). Al-Nanawtawi's Islamic Political Ideology: Paradigms from Rudad, Sawaneh Qasimi and other Selected Writings. V. 1. (2. DIIT, <https://religiousstudies.yale.edu/people/atif-suhail>)
- Wasti, S. Tanvir. (2006). The 1877 Ottoman Mission to Afghanistan, *Middle Eastern Studies*, 30:4, 956-962.
- Zilli, I. A. (2013). Madinah University Se Mutalliq Allama Shibli Ki Nadir Tahrir. *Maarif*, 6, (192), 462-72.